

ASO AC Teleconference

4 December 2019

12:00 PM UTC

Draft Minutes

| Attendees | Observers | Apologies |
|---|---|---|
| AFRINIC Noah Maina (NM) Wafa Dahmani Zaafouri (WD) | ARIN Sean Hopkins (SH) Richard Jimmerson (RJ) | AFRINIC Omo Oaiya (OO) |
| APNIC Brajesh Jain (BJ) Simon Sohel Baroi (SB) | LACNIC Gianina Pensky (GP) | APNIC Aftab Siddiqui (AS) - Chair |
| ARIN Kevin Blumberg (KB) – Vice Chair Louie Lee (LL) Jason Schiller (JS) | RIPE NCC Kaveh Ranjbar (KB) | LACNIC Esteban Lescano (EL) |
| LACNIC Esteban Lescano (EL) Ricardo Patara (RP) Jorge Villa (JV) – Vice Chair | ICANN Staff Carlos Reyes (CR) | RIPE NCC Filiz Yilmaz (FY) |
| RIPE NCC Hervé Clément (HC) Nurani Nimpuno (NN) Filiz Yilmaz (FY) | 2020 ASO AC Representatives Mike Silber (MS - AFRINIC) Martin Hannigan (MH - ARIN) | |
| Secretariat Susannah Gray (SG) – Minutes | Community: 0 | |

New Action Items From This Meeting

- New Action Item 191204-1: ALL to review the Draft 2019 ASO AC Work Plan Activity Review and provide any feedback by 20 December 2019.
- New Action Item 191204-2: ALL to review the Draft 2020 ASO AC Work Plan and provide any feedback before the end of 2019.
- New Action Item 191204-3: AS to send a note to the NRO EC reminding it of the ASO AC Chair Election process and to ask that Board-appointments to the ASO AC occur earlier in the year.
- New Action Item 191204-4: AS to inform the NRO EC that the ASO AC had voted to implement editorial changes to the ASO AC Procedures to update the names of the new mailing lists and ask for approval to implement.
- New Action Item 191204-5: Secretariat to update references to the mailing lists on the ASO AC website once the NRO EC has approved the ASO AC Procedure changes (see Action Item 191204-4).

- New Action Item 191204-6: AS to lead discussion on the Annual Transparency Review during the January ASO AC Teleconference.
 - New Action Item 191204-7: GV to open the ASO AC Chair e-voting period as soon as the new ASO AC members had been added to the mailing list in January 2020. The voting period is to be opened by 5 January 2020.
 - New Action Item 191204-8: ALL to review and comment on the 2020 teleconference schedule by 11 December.
 - New Action Item 191204-9: AS to circulate the ICANN Board Election Process notes on the ac-discuss mailing list.
-

Agenda

0. Welcome
 1. Roll Call
 2. Agenda Review
 3. Approval of Minutes - November 2019
 4. Review Open Actions
 5. 2019 Work Plan Activity Review
 6. 2020 ASO AC Work Plan
 7. Annual Transparency Review
 8. ASO AC Chair Election Schedule
 9. 2020 ASO AC Teleconference Schedule
 10. 2019 ASO AC Appointments Review
 11. ICANN 67 prep
 12. ASO ICANN Board Procedures Review
 13. AOB
 14. Adjourn
-

0. Welcome

KB welcomed the attendees. He explained that AS was unable to attend due to a work commitment and that he would Chair the meeting in AS's absence.

1. Roll Call

SG performed the roll call and declared quorum.

2. Agenda Review

KB proposed the motion to accept the agenda. HC seconded the motion. There were no objections. Motion carried.

3. Minutes Review

BJ proposed the motion to accept the minutes from the November teleconference. JV seconded the motion. There were no objections. Motion carried. KB asked the Secretariat to publish the minutes on the ASO website.

4. Review Open Actions

- **Action Item 191113-1: ALL to review the notes from the ICANN 66 closed working session and provide feedback, questions and additional comments on the Seat 9/10 Election procedures > *IN PROGRESS*.**

KB noted that AS had circulated some notes referring to the Seat 9/10 Election procedures on the ac-internal mailing list (as part of the Transparency Review).

BJ noted that he had sent a comment to the mailing list regarding the text relating to Director Removal.

KB noted that Director Removal was no longer part of the ASO AC's procedures as the Empowered Community Powers now covered it.

NN commented that she had no issue with the notes being published on the ac-discuss mailing list. She added that the ASO AC had kicked off the discussion on the election process during the F2F Meeting and it was not yet concluded. During the session, general ideas were shared which were to be worked on in the coming year. NN continued that, although she agreed in principle, the ASO AC should be cautious about stating that it was mandatory for all ASO AC members to attend all ICANN Board seat candidate interviews.

KB agreed: the terminology used needed careful consideration. He added that the discussion on this should now continue on the ac-discuss mailing list.

-
- **Action Item 191113-2: AS to develop a timeline and process for the items outlined in Action Item 191113-1 > *IN PROGRESS*.**

KB noted that any ASO AC members who would be seated as of 1 January and had time to commit should form a group to discuss improvements to the Seat 9/10 Election procedures. He added that having a consistent set of people attending audio calls and working on this initially would be more productive as this work could not be done effectively via the mailing list. He added that the ASO AC had discussed that the proposed new procedures should be ready for finalization during the F2F meeting in March and that a subset of the ASO AC should meet every two weeks to discuss the procedures prior to this date.

HC pointed out that the current text noted that the proposed new procedures should be presented to the NRO EC during ICANN 68. This middle ICANN meeting, however, was not usually well attended by many ASO AC members.

KB clarified that this was an error and that the text should state that the proposed new procedures should be presented to the NRO EC during ICANN 67.

-
- **Action Item 191113-3: AS/GV to inform the ASO AC of sessions of interest to the Numbers community at ICANN 67 as soon as possible > *OPEN*.**

KB noted that this action item was ongoing and that information on the sessions would likely be circulated in January/February.

BJ noted that the draft 2020 work plan should state that the draft agenda should be circulated eight weeks before F2F meeting.

KB noted that he had no issue with a draft agenda being circulated eight weeks in advance but that the final agenda would probably be distributed two-four weeks in advance.

-
- **Action Item 191113-4: AS to lead the discussion on the ICANN 67 ASO AC session agenda and scheduling over the next three teleconferences > *OPEN*.**

This item was deferred due to AS's absence.

-
- **Action Item 191113-5: HC to circulate the Draft 2019 ASO AC Work Plan Activity Review before the December teleconference > *CLOSED*.**

HC noted he had circulated the Draft 2019 ASO AC Work Plan Activity Review and asked the ASO AC to review and provide feedback.

KB suggested that, in order to finalize this review before the end of the year, the ASO AC provided any input by 20 December. After that, this document would be considered final.

New Action Item 191204-1: ALL to review the Draft 2019 ASO AC Work Plan Activity Review and provide any feedback by 20 December 2019.

-
- **Action Item 191113-6: LL to circulate the draft 2020 ASO AC Work Plan before the December Teleconference for finalization in January when the new ASO AC is in place > *CLOSED*.**

LL noted that he had circulated the draft 2020 ASO AC Work Plan and had received one comment from HC. He added that the only new section was section 7:

- | |
|--|
| <p>7 <i>Begin the appointment process for the ICANN Board Seat No. 9</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. <i>Determine the time frame for the selection process.</i>2. <i>Send out the call for candidates.</i>3. <i>Form the Qualification Review Committee</i> |
|--|

HC commented that section 7.3 stated that the QRC should be formed, but during recent discussion, the ASO AC had proposed that the QRC and IC would no longer be separate committees. He added that section 19 should refer to 2021 rather than 2020.

KB noted the steps in 7.3 were appropriate for the current procedures and suggested that this be made more generic, such as "*Form committees as per the current guidelines for ICANN Director Appointment*".

HC agreed.

NN added that, for section 7.3, it should be made clearer that the text refers to 2021 although the work would start in 2020. She continued that this draft work plan did not adequately capture the work that the ASO AC had set out to do in terms of improving the Board seat selection process, which the ASO AC had committed itself to work on in 2020. Regarding the NomCom process, the work plan should have details of an outreach process so the ASO AC could seek volunteers from the community.

KB agreed.

BJ noted that he had sent a comment regarding 7 to the mailing list.

KB asked the ASO AC to provide further feedback. He asked the new 2020 ASO AC members to also provide comments once they were seated.

New Action Item 191204-2: ALL to review the Draft 2020 ASO AC Work Plan and provide any feedback before the end of 2019.

- **Action Item 191113-7: AS to circulate the draft Annual Transparency Review before the December Teleconference > *IN PROGRESS*.**

AS circulated the draft Annual Transparency Review. Discussion was deferred to the January teleconference.

- **Action Item 191113-8: Secretariat to set up a Confluence site for the ASO AC > *IN PROGRESS*.**

SG explained that the Secretariat was discussing the implementation with the RIPE NCC and would get back to the ASO AC with more information when it was available.

KB asked that, if there were any concerns aside about getting the Confluence site set up, the Secretariat could inform the ASO AC as soon as possible.

- **Action Item 191113-9: GV to circulate the draft ASO AC Chair Election timeline and to ask those regions that have not yet appointed members to do so as soon as possible > *CLOSED*.**

SG noted that AFRINIC and APNIC had not yet appointed the Board-appointed representatives to the 2020 ASO AC. Both Boards would meet soon and were expected to communicate their representative's name by the end of the week.

KB commented that the ASO AC Chair Election nomination period was open and that nominations would be accepted until 14 December. Those nominated would then have until 31 December to accept their nomination.

BJ asked that, if the Boards did not appoint their representative this week, would the deadlines for the ASO AC Chair election change?

KB responded that, as per the procedures, the deadlines would not change and unfortunately those Board-appointed representatives who might be appointed after 14 December would not be eligible to be nominated for the Chair position. He added that these procedures could be reviewed next year if the ASO AC felt it was important.

JS noted that, in the past, the ASO AC had discussed requesting that the NRO EC ask APNIC/AFRINIC to make their appointments earlier.

KB noted that this had been discussed with the NRO EC earlier in the year.

NN commented that RIR meeting timelines could not be changed but the Board-appointed representatives can be selected at any point in the year. She suggested asking the NRO EC again for the Board-appointed representatives to be selected in October/November.

New Action Item 191204-3: AS to send a note to the NRO EC reminding it of the ASO AC Chair Election process and to ask those Board-appointments to the ASO AC occur earlier in the year.

- **Action 191002-01: GV to open a support ticket with Zoom regarding the recurring issue of no microphone option being available for some users upon joining and report back to the ASO AC on progress > *IN PROGRESS*.**

SG explained that GV had opened a support ticket with Zoom support regarding the issue of no microphone option being available for some users upon joining via a browser. The conclusion was that the only browser that supports Zoom audio is Chrome. Details had been sent to the ac-discuss list.

KB noted that, at this point, changing the platform again might be problematic. He suggested that the concerns that the platform might prevent some ASO AC members from participating under certain circumstances could be sent to the NRO EC for it to make a final decision on how to proceed.

JS suggested that FY be asked if using Chrome would be an acceptable solution to the issue.

- **Action Item 190904-3 AS to suggest the term to use to replace the references to the AC-COORD list in the ASO procedures. The wording should match the description of the AC-DISCUSS mailing list on the ASO website > *CLOSED*.**

KB explained that AS had circulated the proposed text changes on the mailing list.

After some discussion, the ASO AC decided that, as the change was an editorial change rather than a procedural one, a roll-call vote on the teleconference would be sufficient rather than an e-vote.

JS proposed the motion to update the ASO AC Operating Procedures as outlined below:

Remove "ac-coord" from all references (4.4.1, 7.3, 8.2) and only mention mailing list along with numbered reference i.e. [1] and at the end clarify the reference

For Example.

7.3. Time Constrained Appointment Requests

The AC Chair may decide to make the appointment by eVote after discussion on the mailing list [1], in order to meet appointment deadline.

....

[1] - "ac-discuss" mailing list. This mailing list is used for ASO-AC Operations. This list has public posting restriction and it is publicly archived.

AND also update the description of "ac-discuss":

ac-discuss

ac-discuss [at] aso [dot] icann [dot] org

This mailing list is used for ASO-AC Operations. This list has public posting restriction and it is publicly archived.

- *subscription open to ASO AC members and RIR/ICANN/IANA staff observers*
- *posts by ASO AC members and designated RIR, ICANN and IANA staff*
- *publicly archived*

NN seconded the motion.

The ASO AC members present on the teleconference then voted unanimously to support the motion via a roll call vote. The motion carried.

New Action Item 191204-4: AS to inform the NRO EC that the ASO AC had voted to implement editorial changes to the ASO AC Procedures to update the names of the new mailing lists and ask for approval to implement.

New Action Item 191204-5: Secretariat to update references to the mailing lists on the ASO AC website once the NRO EC has approved the ASO AC Procedure changes (see Action Item 191204-4).

5. 2019 Work Plan Activity Review

This item was discussed during Action Item 191113-5.

6. 2020 ASO AC Work Plan

This item was discussed during Action Item 191113-6.

7. Annual Transparency Review

New Action Item 191204-6: AS to lead discussion on the Annual Transparency Review during the January ASO AC Teleconference.

8. ASO AC Chair Election Schedule

KB explained that, as per the procedures, the voting period must be open for seven days. This period could begin as soon as the new ASO AC members had been subscribed to the mailing list.

SG noted that the Secretariat aimed to update the mailing lists on 1 January each year.

KB asked the Secretariat to open the ASO AC Chair seven-day e-voting period as soon as the new members were added to the mailing lists at some point before 5 January 2020.

New Action Item 191204-7: GV to open the ASO AC Chair e-voting period as soon as the new ASO AC members had been added to the mailing list in January 2020. The voting period is to be opened by 5 January 2020.

9. 2020 ASO AC Teleconference Schedule

KB suggested that the time slot for the ASO AC teleconferences (12 pm UTC) be kept the same but asked the new ASO AC members to provide input. Where they conflict with RIR meetings, the teleconference date should be adjusted but should always take place on a Wednesday where possible.

HC suggested that in cases of conflict with RIR meetings, the teleconference could take place one week later. He added that, if the teleconference clashed with both meetings in a region, at least one of those teleconferences should be changed. However, in May if the teleconference were to be shifted a week due to the LACNIC Meeting, it would then clash with the RIPE Meeting.

NN agreed and noted that travel days should also be taken into account

KB noted that all teleconference dates should be adjusted so that they do not take place during the RIR meetings. He added that teleconferences should not take place one day before or after an RIR meeting, as people would be travelling.

The ASO AC decided to discuss the timeline further on the mailing list. It agreed that the first teleconference of 2020 would take place on 15 January.

KB asked the Secretariat to send out the appropriate notifications for the 15 January teleconference.

New Action Item 191204-8: ALL to review and comment on the 2020 teleconference schedule by 11 December.

10. 2019 ASO AC Appointments Review

KB noted that the ASO AC had made two appointments during 2019:

- ICANN Multistakeholder Ethos Award Committee: *Kevin Blumberg*.
- ICANN Nominating Committee (NomCom): *Pankaj Chaturvedi*.

11. ICANN 67 prep

KB noted that those members who could commit the time should volunteer to work on the ASO AC activities during ICANN 67. A call for volunteers would go out in January 2020, when the new ASO AC members were seated.

HC and BJ volunteered.

NN commented that ICAN 67 prep had been discussed during the recent F2F meeting. She asked that the Chairs started to work already to secure a slot for the ASO session. She added that in the past the ASO session had been scheduled on a Sunday as the week was busy but, at the F2F meeting, the Chairs had noted that nothing would take place during the weekend due to travel.

CR explained that the block schedule was not yet published. He added that he was also under the impression that the ASO sessions should not take place during the weekend. He would continue working with the ASO leadership to find a suitable timeslot.

NN asked the chairs to work proactively in securing a slot as this would help with travel scheduling.

12. ASO ICANN Board Procedures Review

This item was discussed during Action Item 191113-1.

New Action Item 191204-9: AS to circulate the ICANN Board Election Process notes on the ac-discuss mailing list.

13. AOB

- *Departing ASO AC Members*

NN thanked JS and OO for their dedication and hard work over the years.

The ASO AC concurred.

JS noted that it had been a pleasure working with the ASO AC and hoped that he would have the opportunity to do so again in the future.

14. Adjourn

BJ proposed the motion to adjourn. LL seconded. There were no objections. The meeting ended at 13:37 UTC.

-END-