

ASO AC Teleconference
Wednesday, 7 December 2022
12:00 PM UTC
Draft Minutes

Attendees	Observers	Apologies
AFRINIC Mike Silber (Mike S.) – Vice Chair Saul Stein (Saul S.) APNIC Nicole Chan (Nicole C.) Shubham Saran (Shubham S.) Di Ma (Di M.) ARIN Kevin Blumberg (Kevin B.) – Chair Chris Quesada (Chris Q.) LACNIC Esteban Lescano (Esteban L.) Jorge Villa (Jorge V.) Ricardo Patara (Ricardo P.) RIPE NCC Hervé Clément (Hervé C.) – Vice Chair Sander Steffan (Sander S.) Secretariat Germán Valdez (Germán V.) Laureana Pavón (Laureana P.) – Minutes	ARIN Sean Hopkins (Sean H.) AFRINIC Madhvi Gokool RIPE NCC Angella Dall'Ara ICANN Board Alan Barrett (Alan B.) ICANN Staff Ozan Sahin (Ozan S.) Steve Sheng (Steve S.)	ARIN Martin Hannigan (Martin H.) RIPE NCC James Kennedy (James K.)

New and updated action items from this meeting:

Updated Action Item 221025-2: Esteban L., James K, and Jorge V. to start working on the ASOA AC slide deck for ICANN 76. **OPEN**

New Action Item 221207-1: All ASO AC members will have two weeks to review the proposals shared by the Procedures Review Team so that the Team can consolidate a Procedures Review document to work on in early 2023.

New Action Item 221207-2: German V. to circulate the proposed 2023 ASO AC meeting schedule to incoming members. Barring any concerns, the schedule will be approved as of 20 December.

New Action Item 221207-3: German V. to prepare the schedule for the 2023 NomCom appointment, which needs to be approved in January 2023.

=====

Agenda

0. Welcome
1. Roll Call
2. Agenda Review
3. Approval of Minutes
 - a) 25 October 2022 (day 1 f2f)
 - b) 26 October 2022 (day 2 f2f)
 - c) 2 November 2022
4. Review Open Actions
- 5.- ASO Procedures Review Update
6. 2022 Work Plan Activity Review
7. 2023 ASO AC Work Plan
8. Annual Transparency Review
9. 2023 ASO AC Chair Election Schedule
10. ICANN Leadership Program 2023
11. 2023 ASO AC f2f Meeting
12. 2023 ASO AC Teleconference Schedule
13. 2022 ASO AC Appointments Review
14. Farewell leaving ASO AC members
15. Adjourn

=====

0. Welcome

Kevin B. welcomed everyone to the meeting.

1. Roll Call

Roll call was performed at 12:05 and quorum was established.

2. Agenda Review

While sharing the proposed agenda on screen, Kevin B. moved to approve it as circulated. Esteban L. seconded the motion, no objections were heard, and the motion carried.

3. Approval of Minutes

- a) 25 October 2022 (day 1 f2f)
- b) 26 October 2022 (day 2 f2f)
- c) 2 November 2022

Kevin B. observed that three meeting minutes were pending approval. He moved to approve all three minutes. Hervé C. seconded the motion, no discussion was heard, and the motion carried. The minutes are approved and ready to be circulated publicly.

4. Review Open Actions

Action Item 221102-1: Each subgroup of the Procedures Review Team to meet before late November/early December to consolidate all the suggestions and discussions that took place in Belgrade and start working on a concrete proposal for each of the sections of the procedures under review. **CLOSED**

Kevin B. observed that this action item will also be addressed under agenda item 5.

Hervé C. confirmed that the fourth Procedures Review Team meeting had occurred and that he had shared the output this morning. He will present a slide deck when they discuss agenda item 5.

Action Item 221102-2: Germán V. to contact the NRO EC to ask that the names of the RIR Board appointees to the ASO AC so that everyone will have time to prepare for the ASO AC chair election. **CLOSED**

German V. commented all the members have been confirmed and included in the chair election process.

Action Item 221102-3: Germán V. to schedule the onboarding session for newcomers around two weeks after this 2 November ASO AC meeting. **CLOSED**

Kevin B. noted that the onboarding session had happened and had been very good. As feedback out of that session for the future, he added that the ASO AC members who are coming onboard don't have access to the wiki, so any onboarding documents should be sent to them in pdf format.

Action Item 221025-1: The Secretariat to check visa requirements for Mexico (Cancun) in preparation for ICANN 76. **CLOSED**

Kevin B. mentioned that the AC has confirmation that they will be meeting f2f at ICANN 76.

German V. said that the NRO EC is aware of this and has accepted supporting this meeting. All visa requirements will need to be coordinated with the RIRs directly.

Ozan S. shared that ICANN is expecting registration to open before the end of the week, but that the hotels page is already up and running (<https://76.schedule.icann.org/hotels>).

Kevin B. recommended starting any visa requirements asap.

Esteban L. said he will ask James to share with him the slide deck he used at the last RIPE meeting and use that as a basis to prepare the presentation for the ICANN meeting.

James K. and Jorge V. volunteered to help Esteban L., so Action Item 221025-2 was updated:

Updated Action Item 221025-2: Esteban L., James K, and Jorge V. to start working on the ASOA AC slide deck for ICANN 76. **OPEN**

Kevin B. commented that it's important for the slide deck to include more specificity around global policy and the terms "global policy" and "globally coordinated policy" to explain the work of the ASO AC, as there is confusion on what type of policy the AC can shepherd.

Esteban L. agreed and said he would consider this in the slide deck.

Action Item 221024-1: GV to follow up with the NRO EC about the ASO AC's concerns re quorum, specifically the current vacancy and the two vacancies that will soon occur in AFRINIC to see what the EC recommends as a way forward for the ASO AC. **CLOSED**

German V. noted that this was discussed in the last NRO EC meeting, that the situation in AFRINIC has not changed, that the EC is aware of the lack of appointments to the AC. The EC has acknowledged the situation but cannot do something directly. Instead, they recommend that now that the procedures are being reviewed, the AC might consider addressing this for future situations.

Kevin B. said that it really comes down to the following question: If nobody is seated in a position, does that person count towards quorum? His assumption is that right now our quorum is 14 and in January it will be 13. If the AC would validate that within our procedures, it would be a huge help. But we may not be able to change the procedures (this would require supermajority).

Esteban L. agreed. We are all aware of this concern about losing quorum for our decisions, but while Saul S. is representing AFRINIC, we will be tight but ok to pass the procedures review.

Herve C. added that the work on the procedures review will take into account these situations which can occur in the future, as well as any additional issues we detect so we can share these to the NRO EC.

5.- ASO Procedures Review Update

Hervé C. thanked the members of the Procedures Review Team for their excellent work. He then shared on screen a slide deck he presented to the Team last Friday. Highlights include the following:

The objectives of the meeting were to consolidate next steps and timeline of the Procedures Review Team's work, and for each subgroup to define a list of proposals/corrections they agreed after the AC meeting in Belgrade bring them to the entire ASO AC

Next steps and timeline:

- Consolidate as far as we can list of modifications/proposals per subgroup
- Present the Team's proposal to the entire AC on 7 December (monthly meeting)
- Define a period ending before end-2022 for each ASO AC member to express their opinion/remarks, with the objective of having a consolidated document (list of modifications at the end of 2022).

Re the last bullet point above, Hervé C. suggested two weeks for this. No objections were heard.

Kevin B. explained that silence is very counterproductive to the procedures. As he has already mentioned previously, a supermajority is required to approve the procedures, if somebody abstains or votes against, the changes will not be approved. The AC really needs people to either support or express their concerns. He asked those ASO AC members who will be voting to please review the proposed changes—a lot of work has gone into this—and bring up any concerns you may have.

Hervé C. and Esteban L. agreed with Kevin, noting that right now the AC has time to go deep into the discussions, as we are not in a hurry now, but we will be when we need to vote on this.

To reinforce what Kevin B. said, Ricardo P. added that it's very important to express opinions and concerns. He added that one of the procedures under review relates to ICANN Board member elections, for which a new process will be starting next year.

After some further discussion, the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 2212071: All ASO AC members will have two weeks to review the proposals shared by the Procedures Review Team so that the Team can consolidate a Procedures Review document to work on in early 2023.

Next steps and timeline (cont.):

- January/February 2023 (with the new Council): elaborate updated written paragraphs based on the 2022 work
- ICANN 76 (March 2023 – Cancun): Finalize F2F our proposal
- At the end or after ICANN 76: discussions with the NRO EC
- Mid 2023: Organize a vote (only one vote or one vote per paragraph?) to validate the new version of the procedures

Kevin B. explained that the ASO AC chairs were looking at the scheduling block for ICANN 76 and it looks like we are going to have three half-day slots. We also have our regular ASO AC meeting, potentially a meeting with PTI and other activities, but within those three half-day blocks 4-6 hours for procedures review. As for voting on individual changes vs. voting on the whole document, he noted that, historically, the AC has passed entire versions of procedures to the EC and recommended this approach because the sections for which modifications are being proposed are intertwined.

Esteban L. agreed. In his opinion, it is important to work on an integral review and reform of the procedures.

Kevin B. said that he is hopeful that all AC members can agree on a draft of changes, and we don't have to go to a second or third round.

Hervé C. concluded by saying that he will add an additional step to the plan (complete review of the document to check consistency and so on).

6. 2022 Work Plan Activity Review

Herve C. said he has not done any more work since the proposal he sent in August. Esteban L. has also not had the time to do this yet. Herve C. apologized and said the two can finalize this in January.

Kevin B. suggested having a draft available before 24 December (any time before the holidays), as the work of the body is all but done at that point. This would allow about two weeks from the moment the draft is distributed until the January ASO AC meeting, where it can be approved. The shortest period would be one week, so technically the draft should be shared with the group by 3 January 2023, but before the holidays would be wonderful if possible.

Herve C. agreed.

7. 2023 ASO AC Work Plan

Esteban L. volunteered for this task but asked for someone to volunteer to help him.

Kevin B. volunteered to help Esteban L. with the 2023 ASO AC Work Plan, which they will also aim to end out in the last week of December.

8. Annual Transparency Review

Kevin B. said he will have a draft at the end of the year. He shared that transparency reviews have been conducted since 2018, yet interestingly enough, the transparency review is not in the ASO AC procedures nor documented anywhere else. Kevin B. believes that, over time there's been a divergence from what its intended purpose was to what it's become today. He proposed a reset: identify the areas where the ASO AC should be open and transparent and document this, a checkbox of items that should be open and were indeed open, and the last question should be "Did the AC diverge from its procedures during the year and, if so, why?" In his opinion, this is what the transparency review should be, i.e, "Did we do what we were supposed to do and, if not, why?"

Sander S. said that was a sensible approach. To him, the transparency review is about reporting back to the people that elected us that we did what we promised we would do (checkboxes, attendance records, things like that).

Ricardo P. agreed.

Kevin B will put together a revised document.

Herve C. asked Kevin B. whether, in his opinion, there should be something about the transparency review in the ASO AC procedures.

Kevin B. said that it might be better to have it in the work plan.

Saul S. agreed.

9. 2023 ASO AC Chair Election Schedule

Kevin B. explained that the AC is in the nomination phase, which will close on 31 December. He reminded everyone that, to be on the ballot, a nomination or self-nomination is required, which must be seconded by another ASO AC member, and the nominee must accept the nomination. Voting will open on 2 January, at which point there will be a new ASO AC chair for 2023.

He thanked everybody for his two years as a chair, and added that he will not be running for the position this time.

10. ICANN Leadership Program 2023

Kevin B. shared that the NRO EC has accepted that the AC will provide the names of the chair and a vice chair for the ICANN Leadership Program 2023 course that will take place in 2023 once they are elected.

Esteban L. observed that this is a good opportunity for capacity building.

He then thanked Kevin B. for his hard work and leadership over the past two years.

Hervé C., Ricardo P., James K., Shubham S., Nicole C., Jorge V., Di M., Saul S. also thanked Kevin B. for his work as chair.

Sander S. agreed, adding that even though this is his first year on the AC, he's really impressed with how much work Kevin B. has done.

11. 2023 ASO AC f2f Meeting

Kevin B. reiterated that the AC is looking to have three half-day sessions and a meeting with the ICANN Board, we're trying to not conflict with some of the other programming that ASO AC members would like to attend but giving the AC as much time to meet as possible. He added that once he has more clarity on the block schedule, he will bring this back to the AC.

He shared that everybody should try to be on site on Sunday, as the first ASO AC session will most likely take place on Monday morning. Also, he expects that they will be done by Thursday.

Esteban L. encouraged everyone to try to attend.

Hervé C. observed that attending an ICANN meeting is the opportunity to get a feeling of how ICANN works, so thanks for trying to avoid conflicts with plenary meetings, welcome ceremony, etc.

Steve S. mentioned that, as support staff on the ICANN site, he will work with the AC to understand your needs (number of rooms, capacity) as well as on the timing for these meetings.

Kevin B. thanked Steve S., adding that he will get back to him shortly re the schedule. As for room capacity, 25 is the most participants we've had in the past, with the complexity being the number of microphones.

Steven S. asked whether the three half-day sessions would be three three-hour sessions.

Kevin B. replied that the AC usually follows the general meeting schedule (e.g., morning session or afternoon session with a short break).

Steven S. said he and Kevin B. can discuss off line which conflicts the AC is trying to avoid and define the schedule.

12. 2023 ASO AC Teleconference Schedule

Kevin B. explained that we are going to keep the same time for the calls (12:00 UTC).

German V. showed the proposed meeting dates and potential conflicts on screen and asked whether there were any concerns regarding the schedule that was circulated. He also asked whether the AC would be meeting on 8 March and then on the 13th f2f in Cancun. He added that there might be benefit to having a meeting on the 8th, i.e., some time to prepare for Cancun.

Esteban L. agreed with the proposed meeting dates.

Sander S. agreed to leave the call on the 8th for any final details before the f2f.

Kevin B. asked whether the AC should approve the schedule today or just the January meeting today and the rest during the January ASO AC meeting.

After some discussion, it was agreed to approve the 2023 meeting schedule as circulated.

Kevin B. said that the benefit of having the schedule already approved is that everybody can prepare their calendars. New members will know what the schedule will be for 2023.

The following action item was decided:

New Action Item 221207-2: German V. to circulate the proposed 2023 ASO AC meeting schedule to incoming members. Barring any concerns, the schedule will be approved as of 20 December.

Jorge V. then asked whether there is any ASO presentation scheduled during a public instance at ICANN 76.

Kevin B. explained that historically the ASO AC has done some presentations at ICANN; unfortunately, they have been very poorly attended and had very little benefit to the ASO or to the community. He does not believe a general information session is on the agenda. Unless there is a strong feeling that the AC should be doing that type of thing, he would suggest that next year's chair does not push for this type of session.

Esteban L. said he was of a different idea and wondered whether these public sessions are important to make the AC known by the general community. We need to advertise in some way what we are doing and why it is important to participate and be part of this community. He wondered if a public session might be of benefit in this sense.

Sander S. agreed with Esteban L., adding that the only way we could achieve that is to have something about the AC included in the plenary sessions. However, he does not know how / if that might be approved.

Kevin B. reminded everyone that the AC has a session with the ICANN Board which may be of help to introduce the board to what we are doing in 2023, that's where the most people will probably show up. The AC is not going to get people to come if our session conflicts with other activities, and he feels uncomfortable asking for a plenary slot unless we have a really strong reason to be there.

Alan B. recalled that, several years ago, the ASO asked for a short time during a plenary session. What happened was that a few minutes were allocated during the opening ceremony.

Kevin B. thanked Alan B. for his comment. He said that the ASO as a whole—specifically the NRO EC— has spoken at the plenary, but that he does not believe that the ASO AC specifically should be asking for for a slot during a plenary.

Jorge V. added that this will be the formal number community's return to the ICANN meeting, so it would be interesting to do something, but not make it an overwhelming issue (perhaps something quick at the fellowship program or other instance, not necessarily a long presentation).

13. 2022 ASO AC Appointments Review

Kevin B. observed that, at this point, the only appointment the AC has is to the NomCom (Brajesh Jain). For the NomCom, we usually provide a name around April. The schedule for the NomCom appointment needs to be approved in January.

New Action Item 221207-3: German V. to prepare the schedule for the 2023 NomCom appointment, which needs to be approved in January 2023.

Kevin B. explained that, in previous years, the NomCom appointee was a member of the ASO AC, but that had proven to be a lot of work, so over the past 5-6 years we have looked to our community to see who would like to serve on the NomCom, but with limited success. He then suggested that every member of the AC reach out to possible candidates who might be a good fit for the NomCom.

14. Farewell leaving ASO AC members

Kevin B. thanked Mike S. not only for serving as an AC member but also as a vice chair. He also thanked Martin H. from the ARIN region, and Shubham from the APNIC region for their time on the AC.

All shared in thanking outgoing members for their time and dedication.

Mike S. thanked Kevin B. and said that, hopefully, APNIC will sort things out soon and he will see everyone once again.

Kevin B. wished everybody a wonderful holiday season, reminded them to review the documents that Hervé C. had sent out (procedures review), and wished for a good start of the new year.

15. Adjourn

There being nothing further business to discuss, Shubham S. moved to adjourn the meeting, Mike S. seconded the motion, no objections were heard, and the meeting was adjourned at 13:21 UTC.